The Rediscovery of Uisang's Ch'udonggi

In Korea, the monk Uisang 義湘 (625-702) is generally regarded as a major figure in the history of Silla 新羅 Buddhism. After having studied in China with Zhivan 智儼 (602–86) he returned home, built many temples, and became the founder of the Korean Hwaŏm School 華嚴宗. His influence spread widely, and in Japan, too, he came to be revered as one of the patriarchs of the Kegon School 華嚴宗. This is not so much because of his writings, of which very little remains. His reputation is based, rather, on various records concerning his life, such as his biography in the Song gaoseng chuan 宋髙僧傳 [Biographies of Great Monks [compiled during the] Song], records in the Samguk yusa 三國遺事 [Memorabilia of the Three Kingdoms], which include a letter to him by his fellow-disciple Fazang 法藏 (643-712), and passages in the writings of the Koryŏ monk Kyunyŏ 均如 (923-73). As far as we know, of his own writings only two survive, of which Hwaŏm ilsŭng pŏpkyedo 華嚴一乘法界圖 [One Vehicle Diagram of the Dharma Worlds of the Flower-Garland is best known. In any case, Uisang does not seem to have been a very prolific author, perhaps, it has been suggested, because he did not feel that long expositions were of much use. 1 That a few words may be better

¹ Cf. Kim Tujin, *Kyunkŏ Hwaŏm sasang yŏn'gu* [A Study of Kyunyŏ's Hwaŏm Thought]. Seoul: Ilchogak, 1983, p. 318.

than many is also expressed in more poetic fashion by a legend about the writing of the Pŏpkyedo. After he had been encouraged by Zhiyan to write down his insights into enlightenment, Uisang first composed a long text of ten volumes. At Ws masters urging he abbreviated this work and then the two of them committed everything that Uisang had written to the flames, with a prayer that only that should remain which exactly conformed to Buddha's teachings. In the end only 210 characters turned out to be fully fire-proof and those Uisang used to compose the gātha, written down in a peculiar diagrammatic form, which we know as *Hwaŏm ilsŭng pŏpkyedo*.²

Whatever the reasons, the material for an appraisal of Uisang's contributions to Korean and East Asian Buddhism is scanty at best. Considering this state of affairs, the discovery of a work that enables us to get closer to Uisang's thinking is an important event. In the Autumn 1996 issue of Hankuk hakpo 韓國學報 (Journal of Korean Studies, not to be confused with the English-language publication of that name) a Korean scholar, Kim Sanghyŏn 金相鉉 argues his claim to have made such a discovery, and quite convincingly so.³ The work concerned is an exposition on Hwaŏm/Huayan doctrine, called *Ch'udonggi* 銅洞記 [Record of Ch'udong], a resume of Uisang's teachings written down by the most prominent of his direct disciples. Although of this text some quotations can be found in the writings of others, up till now it has been supposed to be no longer extant. Kim Sanghyŏn, however, has compared the known fragments of the Ch'udonggi with another work on Huayan thought, traditionally attributed to Fazang, to arrive at the conclusion that the correspondence of the two is such that one may speak of two versions of one work by Uisang (the one only surviving in fragments, the other complete).

The gist of the argument is as follows. It is said that Uisang once lectured for ninety days on the Avatamsaka sūtra in a place called Ch'udong, for the spiritual benefit of the deceased mother of one of his disciples, who, in spite of the fact that she was a widow, had encouraged her son to leave her side and become a monk. Another of Uisang's disciples, Chit'ong 智通 (n.d.), then wrote down the essence of his master's teachings in a work of two fascicles, entitled Record of Ch'udong. It was transmitted in Korea until the Koryŏ period and then lost out of sight forever, or so it seemed. In Japan, meanwhile, another work of two fascicles explaining Huayan doctrine was handed down, under the title Huayan jing wenda 華嚴經問答 [Questions and Answers on the Avatamsaka Sūtra]. It was considered to be by Fazang, but its authenticity as such was already questioned in the Heian period. Nonetheless it was included in the *Taishōdaizōkyō* (T. 1873.45) and the *Dainihon zokuzōkyō* (new

² The History and Culture of Buddhism in Korea. Ed. by The Korean Buddhist Research Institute. Seoul: Dongguk University Press, 1993, pp. 89-90.

³ Kim Sanghyŏn, "Ch'udonggi-wa kŭ ibon Hwaŏmgyŏng mundap [The Ch'udonggi and its Variant Edition Huayan jing wenda]," Hangukhakpo 84 (1996), pp. 28-45.

edition no. 103), for through the ages the Questions and Answers found devotees as well as detractors. As late as 1959, Kamata Shigeo 鎌田茂雄 made a plea for the authenticity of Fazang's authorship. In 1983, however, Yoshizu Yoshihide 吉津宜英 suggested that it might have been written in Silla by someone close to Zhiyan, and pointed out similarities in terminology in this text and Uisang's Popkyedo.⁴ Subsequently, Ishii Kōsei 石井公成 provided more detailed corroborative evidence for the theory that a direct disciple of Uisang was the compilator.⁵

Now Kim Sanghyon has not only confirmed that the *Questions and Answers* on the Avatamsaka Sūtra contains the teachings of Uisang, but also found very strong evidence that this work is, in fact, nothing but a variant edition of the Ch'udonggi. As said, of the latter—although supposedly lost as a separate work—fragments were transmitted in the form of quotations in other texts. The priest Kyunyŏ, a major exponent of Hwaom thought in Korea, cites the *Ch'udonggi* in several of his writings, twelve times in toto. Because he sometimes quotes the same passage in different contexts, there are altogether nine fragments of the Ch'udonggi preserved in his works, with about 1200 characters. Carefully comparing these with the *Questions and* Answers on the Avatamsaka sūtra, Kim Sanghyŏn has found corresponding passages for all of them. In addition to this, the total number of non-matching characters is so small that one cannot but conclude that the Ch'udonggi and the Questions and Answers are different editions of one and the same work. It is very unlikely that this would actually be by Fazang (and, consequently, that the attribution of the Ch'udonggi is erroneous). In the Heian period, doubts with regard to Fazang's authorship were mainly motivated by stylistic considerations, but from a doctrinal point of view, too, it is difficult to regard the Questions and Answers as his work. Such problems do not arise if one opts for the obvious solution of viewing the text as a record of Uisang's preaching. The attribution to Fazang should be understood in connection with his growing influence in late Silla Buddhism.

The identification of the Ch'udonggi with a work that in Japan was copied and reprinted from the Heian to the Tokugawa period (and finally, thanks to its transmission in Japan, included in the *Taisho Tripitaka*) is not only important because it grants us a new angle on Uisang's thought, but also because it will be helpful for our understanding of the historical relationship of Chinese, Korean and Japanese Buddhism.

> Boudewijn Walraven University of Leiden

⁴ Yoshizu Yoshihide, "Kyūrai jōbutsu ni tsuite (On the Original Attainment of Buddhahood)," *Indōgaku* bukkyōgaku kenkyū 63 (1983), 243–48.

⁵ Cf. Ishii Kōsei, "Kegonkyō mondō no chosha (The Author of the Huayati jing wenda)," Indōgaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū 33:2 (1985), and his Kegon shisō no kenkyū (A Study of the History of Avatamsaka Thought). Tokyo: Shunjusha, 1996.



The Classification and *Depositing of Books and* Scriptures Kept in the National Library of Bhutan

Per Kjeld Sørensen *NLB*, *Thimphu*

Guiding criteria for classifying and depositing written and printed books (*dpe deb*) kept in The National Library of Bhutan (hereafter; NLB, '*Brug rgyal yongs dpe mdzo*): All books are to be marked both with an inventory and a depository number. Books and prints are to be classified and deposited according to the following alphabetically arranged typological (i.e. genre) classification code (KA through NA) listed below in tandem with an additional letter code which indicates the book's sectarian provenience (bka', dge, mying, sa, jo and bon), whenever feasible or required. In other words, each book marked with a given type code is in addition assigned with a code providing information regarding the book's sectarian origin or affiliation, if identifiable. Canonical writings is coded and deposited separately. Books or collections coded with a sectarian letter-code are allocated to their respective sectarian depository found in the main-building. A non-canonical individual text or a collection/series of texts (belonging together), that is not directly and immediately to be identified as the writings) of a scholar or monk adhering to a distinct and known school (*chos lugs*), shall be assigned with a depository or signature code and number that places it in the section solely arranged according to the overall genre classification (i.e. KA through NA) of the library depositories.

Accordingly, it is herewith proposed that the library accommodate three main depository sections (*rtsa ba'i sde tshan*) each with distinct holdings of books and prints:

1. Canonical Writings

- 2. Books and Writings Arranged According to Sectarian Provenance
- 3. Non-Sectarian or Genre-Classified Books, Writings and Prints

Sect Code

bKa': bKa' brgyud pa (all sub-schools and lines)

dGe: dGe lugs pa incl. bKa' gdams pa

Sa: Sa sky a and Ngor

rNying: rNying ma pa (and rDzogs chen)

Jo: Jo nang pa Bon: Bo

1st Section: Canonical Writings

Section 1 will include, exclusively, all available editions of the Buddhist Canon (*bka' 'gyur and bstan 'gyur*) treasured in the NLB as well as individual or stray copies of any canonical work, such as *sūtra*-s and *śāstra*-s etc. A print or fascicle of a *sūtra* (*mdo*), *vinaya* (*'dul ba*) or *tantra* (*rgyud*) text, for instance, will consequently be marked or coded: 1-KA-xxxxx: The number 1 indicates section 1, KA indicating geme or type class (as given below) and the digits xxxxx indicating the relative depository number code to be given to the work in question.

2nd Section: Books and Writings Arranged According to Sectarian Provenience

Section 2, covering by far the largest section in the library, shall be comprising all the *chos skad* and *rdzong kha* written books and scriptures, arranged and stored according to genre type and sect or school of its authors. A biography (*rnam thar*), for instance, of any of the great Sa-skya masters, written by one of his pupils, should thus be coded: 2-SA-DA-xxxxxxx. The number 2 for section 2, SA for the Sa-skya-pa school and DA for the typological category of the book (here *rnam thar*), and finally the digits xxxxxxx for its depository number.

Notice: For reasons of simplification, the collected writings or a collection, a text-cycle (chos skor) or a set of books, for instance the Rin chen gter mdzod, the sGrub thabs kun 'dus, dGongs pa zang thal or the gDams ngag mdzod etc. which may or may not contain works and texts that individually should require or claim a separate depository code and hence location, such a collection, since it is considered an inseparable and coherent grouping of books, shall be located under the code or class that is indicated by its main title, in this case invariably under TA, TA being the typological class code for collections.

3rd Section: Non-Sectarian or Genre-classified Books, Writings and Prints

Section 3 will comprise books or prints, that are usually not registered sectwise but mainly according to type, in other words classified and deposited purely

according to the type or genre characterizing its contents. A salient example may be 'Gos Lotsava gZhon nu dpal's *Deb ther sngon po*, which is assigned to section 3 and hence marked or coded 3-NA-xxxxxx. The number 3 indicating the third section, NA indicating the genre or type class (in this case a prominent specimen of the *deb ther* genre) as given below and xxxxxx again indicating its relative depos. number code to be given to the particular book in question.

CLASSIFICATION SCHEME

Class Code:

Canonical Scripture (Section 1):

KA: bka' 'gyur dang bstan 'gyur

- 1. mdo sde
- 2. 'dul ba
- 3. chos mngon
- 4. rgyud 'bum
- 5. gzungs 'dus
- 6. bstod tshogs
- 7. rgyud
- 8. sher phyin
- 9. dbn ma
- 10. sems tsam
- 11. 'dul 'grel
- 12. tshad ma
- 13. sgra mdo
- 14. sna tshogs

Extracanonical or Paracanonical Scripture (Section 2 and 3):

KHA: mdo 'grel mtshan nyid kyi skor: Any 'grel ba, rnam 'grel, mam bshad, dka' 'grel, rgya cher bshad pa, mchan 'grel, mchan du bkod pa, rnam bzhag, brjed byang, zin bris su bkod pa etc. on:

- 1. ['dul ba] mdo sde
- 2. dbu ma
- 3. sems tsam
- 4. tshad ma
- 5. phar phyin (bstan bcos)
- 6. grub mtha'

Pāramitāyāna: Hermeneutics, Exegeses, Analyses, Explication, Annotation, Commentatorial Treatises or Summaries, Expose on Doctrine, Canonical Texts/Topics and Philosophy (*mtshan nyid*) as well as Thematically Related Indigenous Doxography (*grub mtha'*).

GA: sgrub thabs, gsang sngags dang rgyud 'grel kyi skor:

- 1. sgrub thabs, bsnyen sgrub, thugs sgrub, tshe sgrub, ril sgrub, sgrub skor, nor sgrub, mngon rtogs, bzlas brjod, bskyed rim, rdzogs rim
- 2. bla sgrub (bla [ma'i] sgrub [thabs]), gsang sgrub, bdag bskyed, bskyed rdzogs, bum bskyed, dmigs rim, sgom rim
- 3. bla ma'i rnal 'byor,
- 4. gzungs, sngags
- 5. rgyud dang rgyud 'grel ['grel bshad, dka' 'grel, rnam bzhag la sogs pa]
- 6. bka' 'gyur dang bstan 'gyur nang ma tshud pa'i rdzogs chen dang rnying ma chos tshan ga ci ra in rung sde tshan 'di gi nang tshudpa in /dpe 'badpa cin I ring brgyudb bka' ma: gsangs sngags nang rgyud sde gsum, nye brgyud gter ma, zab mo dag snang, phyag rgya chen po la sogs pa gzum in /

Mantrayāna: Invocational-Meditational and Propitiatory Texts and Books incl. *guruyoga*, as well as Indigenous Commentaries and Sub-Commentaries, and Expositions on Tantric Texts and Treatises. Lastly also All (Single-volume) Non-Canonical Tantric Scriptures (*bka' ma, gter ma*) foremostly of the rNying ma and rDzogs chen school. [NB! For separately transmitted or entire text cycles (e.g. *Klong chen snying thig, rNyingma rgyud 'bum*, etc.) as well as Collections of *sādhana, dhāraṇī* and *tantra* etc. See also under class code TA].

NGA: lam rim bio sbyong nyams len dang gsung mgur sogs kyi skor:

- 1. lam rim, thar lam
- 2. lam 'bras, slob bshad
- 3. blo sbyong
- 4. gsung bgros dang gsung thor bu, bka ' thor bu, ngag thor bu, bka ' rgya, gsung mchan, mdzod
- 5. nyams len, phyag len
- 6. gsung mgur, rdo rje 'i glu [mgur], chos glu, nyams mgur, thol glu

Doctrinal Treatises and Compositions: Stages-on-the-Path and Mind-Training Texts, Miscellanea incl. Texts of Religious Experience, Songs of Spiritual Realization.

CA: smon lam dang gsol 'debs sogs kyi skor:

- 1. smon lam, gsol 'debs, 'dod gsol [gi smon tshig], mnga'gsol, smon 'debs, byin 'debs, shis brjod, mchod brjod, gros 'debs, spyan 'dren
- 2. bla 'debs [= bla ma'i brgyudpa gsol 'debs], zhabs brtan, brtan zhugs
- 3. phrin bcol
- 4. bsnyen yig, bsnyen pa
- 5. sdig bshags dang ltung bshags' 'tshogs bshags, skong bshags dang bskang gsol, bshags sdom dang bshags brjod, gso sbyong, bskang gso
- 6. bstod pa, bstod tshogs, dbang bstod, mchod bstod
- 7. bsngo yig, bsngo ba

8. bka' bsgo, rjes gnan

Prayer Texts: Aspiration (*praṇidhāna*), Devotional, Supplication, Petitions for Blessings, Vows, Absolution and Confessional Texts etc. as well as Eulogies.

CHA: zhal gdams man ngag dang khrid yig gi skor:

- 1. zhal gdams, gdams ngag, gdams pa, gdams chos, man ngag
- 2. khrid yig, dmar khrid, lam khrid dmigs khrid, tshe khrid, don khrid
- 3. bslab bya
- 4. sngon 'gro, ngo sprod, klog thabs
- 5. yig cha
- 6. zhu [s] lan, yig lan, dris lan, thob yig, gsan yig
- 7. zin bris, mtshan tho, tho yig, par tho, brjed byang, sa bead
- 8. rtsod gleng, rtsod zlog
- 9. dgag pa, dgag lan

All Types of Esoteric Instructions, Precepts, Guidance Texts Propaedeutics, Monastic College Manuals and Obligatory Syllabuses as well as Question- Replies Manuals and Texts, Catechisms, Writings on Teachings Received, Synopses, Memoranda and Notes, Polemics, Apologetics, Critique, Dialectics etc.

JA: mdo sngags chos spyod sogs kyi cho ga'i skor:

- 1. sbyin sreggi cho ga, dkyil 'khor kyi cho ga, sbyang ba'i cho ga, sa bcud bum sgrub kyi cho ga, sdom pa 'bogs pa'i cho ga, rjes 'dzin cho ga, lhan thabs
- 2. phyag mchod [= phyag 'tshal dang mchod pa], mchod 'bul, gsol mchod, tshogs mchod, sgrub mchod, rnchod bstod, bsangs rnchod, mdiod phreng
- 3. bla mchod [= bla ma mchod pa ^ri cho ga]
- 4. bzlog bsgyur, gtor bzlog, gtor bshad, gtor 'bul, bdud bzlog, gto bsgyur, brul gtor, gtor ma, klu gtor, gto bcos, gtor cho ga, gtang rag, gzor gyi cho ga, tshe 'gugs
- 5. mdos cho ga, bsgyur mdos, mdos bzlog, glud, srog glud, 'gegs sel, bcos thabs, lho sgo
- 6. gcod, dur gcod, tshar gcod, zhi byed, 'khrugs bskong
- 7. las byang, las tshogs, las rim, rab gnas
- 8. gser bskyems, khrag skyems, ja mchod, lto mchod
- 9. khrus gsol, byabs khrus
- 10. dbang cho ga, dbang bskur, bdag dbang, dbang bshad

Liturgical, Ritual and Ceremonial Texts: Apotrophaic, Purificatory, Protective or Prophylactic (Charm, Ransom), Votive, Performatory and Propitiatory Opuscula, Oeuvre and Manuals.

NYA: rig gnas che chung sogs kyi skor:

1. bzo rig pa, zlos gar, a lce lha mo, 'khrab gzhung, sku rten bzhengs tshul thig rtsa skor, zhing dang dkyil 'khor gyi bkod pa, rten gyi skor tshad, ras ris 'bri tshul, bris yig, gtor bzo

- 2. sgra rig pa, sum cu dang rtags 'jug [gi 'grel ba], sgra brda'i bstan bcos, brda' gsar mying gi skor, dag yig, tshig mdzod, mngon brjod, snyan ngag, dper brjod, sdeb sbyor, ming gi mam grangs, yig bskur, dpe ris, legs bshad, lugs kyi bstan bcos
- 3. gso rig [= gso ba rig pa], sman gzhung, khog 'bugs/dbub, 'khrungs dpe
- 4. rtsis (mg dang dkar), rtsis gzhung, skar rtsis, mo rtsis, mo 'debs, [rmi lam bya sgra sogs kyi] rtags dpyad, sho mo 'debs, zor phen, phyva phrin
- 5. gtan tshigs rig pa

The Traditional Buddhist Sciences: Arts and Crafts, Iconography and Iconometry, Grammar, Dictionary, Glossaries, Lexica, Poetry (Belles Lettres), Prosody, Medicine, Herbal Science, Astrology, Divination, Geomancy.

TA: gsung 'bum dang chos skor sogs kyi skor:

- 1. gsung 'bum, bka' 'bum, gsungs rab
- 2. chos skor, chos sde

Collected Writings (*opera omnia*), Entire Text Cycles and Collections f. ex. Byams chos sde Inga etc., Sets and Series, but also Minor Writings.

THA: rnam thar 'khrung rabs dang gter chos sogs kyi skor:

- 1. rnam thar [phyi nang gsang]
- 2. 'khrungs rabs, skyes rabs, gdan rabs, khri rabs, sku phreng, gdung rabs
- 3. rtogs brjod
- 4. [bka'i] thangyig, bka'thang
- 5. Bka' ma, gter ma, gter chos, gter yig, gter lung, gter mdzod, gter byang, kha byang, bris byang, zhal byang

(Sacred Hagiographies, Biographies, Birth-Stories, Throne-Successions, Monastic and Clan Genealogies, Chronicles, School Lineages, Mythographical Writings, Pseudo-epigraphica.) [NB! For multi-volumed Collections of *bka' ma* or *gter ma*, *gter mdzod* see TA].

DA: rgyal rabs chos 'byung dang gnas yig sogs kyi skor:

- 1. chos 'byung, bstan 'byung
- 2. rgyal rabs, deb ther, yig tshang, lo rgyus
- 3. dkar chag, gnas yig, lam yig, gnas bshad, gnas bstod, byung khungs, skor tshad, lag khyer
- 4. bstan rtsis, re'u mig
- 5. khrims yig, bca'yig, chab shog, phrin yig, yi ge, springs pa, springs yig
- 6. bka' chems, zhal chems
- 7. sgrung, gtam rgyud, gtam sgrung [incl. ge sar sgrung/rabs text cycle]
- 8. glu gzhas, glu deb, gtam dpe, dpe chos
- 9. be'u bum, 'bel gtam, mol ba
- 10. [ma 'ongs] lung bstan, lung byang

(Sacred and Secular Historiography: (Monastic or National) Chronicles, Genealogies, Records, Annals, Law Code Books, Documents, Dossiers etc. as well as Religious Chronology, Chronology Charts, Guides, Catalogues, Topographical Eulogies, Biographical Testaments, Registers, Tables of Contents, Topical Outline, Synopses, Tables, Narrative Literature, Stories, Tales, Fables, Myths, Songs (Secular, Non-Religious), Prophesies.)

NA: *dpe deb sna tshogs kyi skor*: Miscellaneous Texts.

Seminar on the Zhiyi's Mohe zhiguatt in Leiden

From the 13th–18th of January, 1997, the Department of Japanese Studies, the University of Leiden, on the initiative of Lucia Dolce and Professor W. J. Boot, hosted a week-long seminar on the *Mohe zhiguan/Makashikan* 摩訶止觀 (Treatise on the Great Calming and Contemplation), the *opus major* of Zhiyi 智顗 (538–597), the *de facto* founder of the Chinese Tiantai School 天台宗 of Buddhism. The seminar was conducted by Paul L. Swanson of Nanzan University in Nagoya, Japan, and was attended by some sixteen scholars and advanced students from The Netherlands, Germany, Italy, and Denmark.

In the course of the seminar various parts of the *Mohe zhiguan* was read and its contents discussed, these parts included the important preface by Guanding 灌頂 (561–632), Zhiyi's leading disciple, which forms a synopsis of the entire work; as well a most of chapter seven. The reading and the subsequent discussion was greatly stimulated and facilitated by the fact that Prof. Swanson had prepared a densely annotated translation of the parts of the *Mohe zhiguan*, in addition to providing a superb introduction to the text and a state of the art discussion of current scholarship in the field of Chinese Tiantai studies. This made it possible for in-depth discussion of the many abstruse points in the text, and also gave Prof. Swanson the oportunity to "test" his own reading of the text, which would sometime differ from that of the other participants in the seminar.

Among the issues touched upon during the seminar was Zhiyi's view(s) on the buddhanature 佛性, the $tr\bar{\imath}k\bar{a}ya$, the use of formal logic in the $Mohe\ zhiguan$, his integration of the various classes of doctrines, and his mahāyānaztion of the traditional meditation-practices ascribed to the $hin\bar{a}y\bar{a}na$. At some point a heated debate arouse on the question of Zhiyi's supposeed indeptedness to the Sanlun 三論 monk Jizang 吉藏 (549–623). In the course of the seminar there were also two presentations on related topics. Dr. Gregor Paul gave a lecture on the role of Buddhist logic, $my\bar{o}ji$ 明理, in Japan during the Nara Period, and Jörg Plassen presented the findings of his latest research on Jizang.

There were two young German scholars in the meeting, Dr. Hans Kantor of Bonn, and Herr Jorg Plassen of Hamburg University, both of whom made a favourable and fine impression with their seriousness and erudition. It is indeed a great pleasure for an "Old Rat" in the field of Chinese Buddhism to see that there is actually a new generation of competent scholars emerging in this rather lonely field of research here in Europe.

One could wish that the Asian departments of other universities would host similar seminaries attended by both senior scholars and advanced students, since it is a great stimulous for all participants to meet in a forum of this kind. Just imagine spending a whole week reading and studying a Chinese or Japanese text of your own choice in a forum of likeminded scholars! Lucia Dolce and Professor Boot are to be congratulated for making this seminar possible as well as for making it a great success.

Henrik H. Sørensen