Book Reviews

Sakyadhītā: Daughters of the Buddha

Feminine Ground: Essays on Women and Tibet

In the last five years there has been a wave of new books on women and Buddhism, written in a feminist context and motivated by questions that concern Western women practitioners. Sakyadhītā and Feminine Ground are two of these, and each fills a niche not covered by previous works.

Sakyadhītā is a sensitively edited and abridged version of the proceedings of the first International Conference of Buddhist Nuns, held in Bodhgaya, India in February, 1987. Seventy nuns and 80 lay-people from Burma, China, Taiwan, Japan, Korea, Nepal, Tibet, Sri Lanka, Thailand, Vietnam, Europe, Canada, and the United States came together to learn from each other and to promote mutual understanding. The focus of the conference and book is the role of nuns in Buddhist practice across the various traditions.

The largest chapter of the book includes up-to-date reports on problems for nuns in each of the represented Asian countries. Though most of these countries are patriarchal in social structure, overt sexism is not necessarily the biggest problem for nuns, who may be struggling for physical or cultural survival. Indirect expression of sexism, however, may be of significant influence. These problems were of greatest importance:

1) cultural destruction and displacement (Tibet, Vietnam);
2) gaps in religious lineage due to restrictions on authorized nun ordinations (Sri Lanka, Thailand);
3) lack of education—inadequate access to religious texts and trained teachers (most places);
4) lack of financial support—sometimes economic competition with monks for local support of temple control (Japan, Thailand);
5) inconsistent standards for monks and nuns in precepts and social rules (Thailand, Sri Lanka);
6) lack of social/cultural support for women to choose religious life over family responsibilities;
7) complete non-recognition of nun status (Thailand).

By covering these challenges in specific country-by-country detail, this chapter provides an invaluable baseline reference for future dialogue.

Technical questions about ordination requirements and "the bhiksuni issue" are covered in both practical and philological frameworks. Several sections offer refreshing insight into tradi-
tional text interpretations, pointing the way for dynamic evolution of the role of women's practice. Religious arguments to state or temple authorities will need to address these textual obstacles, if women are to be able to make an effective social contribution as religious professionals.

Feminine Ground is a collection of essays by six Western women scholars whose academic focus is Tibet. The diverse topics include female role models for women's practice, relationship to the land as feminine presence, the experience of enlightenment, dākinī as feminine principle, the sociology of women in Tibet, and nuns and nunneries. The authors chose specifically not to limit their discussion to a single disciplinary framework, so the book offers an unusual cross-section of cultural elements influencing Tibetan women's practice. Each essay is extensively referenced in rigorous academic style, drawing on original Tibetan documents as well as western reviews of Buddhist thought.

The essays by Gross and Willis illuminate feminine relationality and emptiness as two aspects of wisdom. Gross develops a hagiographic analysis of Yeshe Tsogyel—enlightened consort of Padmasambhava, emphasizing Yeshe Tsogyel's relational life. She contrasts conventional relationships characterized by power abuse and compulsive action, with dharmic relationships where wisdom power is used to enlighten all beings. Willis clarifies the dākinī principle, "mksa 'gro ma" or "sky-walking woman", to reveal sky as emptiness and walking as understanding—i.e., the feminine embodiment of wisdom. She reviews the context for the traditional appearance of the dākinī to show her role in prophecy, protection, and inspiration. Both essays offer innovative feminist analysis and excellent scholarship to provide a deeper understanding of Buddhist practice and philosophy revealed by female figures.

But stories of miraculous female beings have little to do with everyday social reality in Tibet. Drawing on feminist methods of analysis, Aziz looks at aspects of language, social status, and women's work to suggest a preliminary sociological picture of women in Tibet. Willis' life history accounts of five nuns contributes further detail on the context for women's practice in this culture. The overall state of Tibetan nunneries today, pre- and post-invasion is summarized in Tsomo's statistical review. Of 18,000 nuns practicing in the 1950s, tragically only 900 Tibetan women remain in formal spiritual training, all exiles.


As more and more Western women make a serious commitment to Buddhist practice, there will be an increasing need for books that address women's concerns, practice issues, role models, and paths to enlightenment. Buddhism has arrived on Western shores to meet feminism, now well beyond the first seeds of consciousness-raising. Feminist thought, analysis, and experiential approach find common ground with Buddhist philosophy, but not necessarily with Buddhist institutions. These books, including Sakyadhita and Feminine Ground, provide avenues for discussion.
and action, enabling women to develop a full and
rich spiritual practice in the Western social con-
text.

The strengths of Sakyadhita lie in the excel-
lient integration of material by editor Karma Lekshe
Tsomo. She provides helpful introductory pas-
sages and a clear explication of technical problems
with nun ordination. The book serves a useful
function as a reference tool for nuns and nunneries
all over the world. The sections on education and
community living need further vision and develop-
ment (perhaps the next conference). I would also
like to see more discussion of the problems with
political organizing of nuns as it conflicts with
Buddhist teachings of egolessness.

Feminine Ground, by contrast, suffers from
lack of a strong integrative theme or sense of
relationship between chapters. Though the essays
offer a wide diversity of perspectives, there is no
clear, overall statement emerging from the collec-
tion. Each essay, however, is in itself a superbly
referenced piece of scholarship, bringing to the
fore in one volume, the voices of the major
Western women scholars of Tibetan Buddhism.
The essays together with the references are an
outstanding resource for the serious student of
women and Buddhism.

Despite their minor weaknesses, these two
volumes make a substantial contribution to the
growing collection of thoughtful material on women
and Buddhism. As women in Western cultures
expand their participation in Buddhist institutions
and interpretation of Buddhist texts, we can expect
the appearance of more serious writing and solid
scholarship in this field. Such work offers new
perspectives on Buddhism that will be useful not
only to women, but to all students of the Dharma.

Stephanie Kaza
Graduate Theological Union
Berkeley, CA
Red Star Over Tibet

A classic of modern Tibetan history, Norbu's book deals with the consequences of the Chinese occupation/liberation of Tibet. The book begins in 1951 with a sketch of Norbu's family life in the village of Tashigang outside the major city of Sakya in southern Tibet. From there, the first person narrative covers some of the major events of Norbu's life as he witnesses the original arrival of the Chinese, experiences various Chinese "programs," flees with his family to India in late 1959 at the age of eleven, and in a recent second edition, concludes in reflection upon the Cultural Revolution and the future prospects of the Tibet situation.

Norbu's book is commonly cited as a midpoint on the continuum between Chinese propaganda and a predominantly western-authored romantic memory of the Tibet that was. On one level, his work is just that. For, while he cites Chinese rule as ultimately "colonial, inhumane and tyrannous" (p. 212), he remembers the Tibet that was as "decadent, inefficient and feudal" (p. 211). However, to consider Norbu solely in light of this continuum is to fail to recognize a perhaps more important dimension of his work.

Norbu's work deserves notice as an example of insider ethnography. He has produced a work about Tibet and Tibetans authored by a Tibetan. Red Star is rare amongst Tibetan authored works in English translation in that it is not primarily a religious work, but an ethnographic work. By conscientiously trying to tell his story, Norbu's book is at once restricted and revealing. It is restricted in the sense that he does not provide the information that many western readers may be searching for in a work of this nature. Absent are grand-scale horror stories of widespread Chinese abuse, in their place, the daily wants, longings and fears of a local population at a specific time and place in a cultural trauma. Norbu's contextualization is strict, particularly in the first edition portions of the book, and does not lend itself to the aggrandizement of generalization.

While readers may want for the lack of the "big picture," Red Star Over Tibet is rich in the revelation of minute details of Tibetan village life. Household rituals, the missionary activities of Tibetan Buddhists to the nomads of the vast Tibetan plateau, and the words of learned monks to a young lay Tibetan are amongst the scenes presented by Norbu. He is particularly apt in chronicling the historic import of religious life to lay Tibetans. Indeed, while Tibetans seemed able to accept the Chinese teachings that the upper strata of Tibetan society was guilty of generations of social abuse, they did not accept the teachings that religion was "the poison of the people." (Norbu relates that "poison" was inserted into the Marxist phrase, for the Tibetan language has no equivalent to "opiate.")
Like many commentators on the Tibetan situation, Norbu points out the import of the Dalai Lama to Tibetans in general and to the resolution of the China-Tibet conflict in particular. His hope is that the leadership of the Dalai Lama may be the key to an eventual solution. The second edition of Red Star Over Tibet came out before the 1989 Nobel Peace Prize was awarded to the Dalai Lama, and this award seems to confirm that the Dalai Lama is not only a key to the resolution of the Tibetan situation, but a person with a social and religious vision important to the whole of contemporary society. Norbu’s book is a traditional classic as it tells well an interesting and complicated tale. It is a contemporary classic as it utilizes an insider’s voice to tell the insider’s tale.

George McKinley
Graduate Theological Union
Berkeley, CA
To Lhasa and Beyond: Diary of the Expedition to Tibet in the Year 1948

This is a reprint of a classic work first published in translation from Italian in 1956. A personal travel account written by Giuseppe Tucci, the "Godfather" of modern Tibetology, To Lhasa and Beyond provides a rare and insightful view of traditional Tibet before the Chinese took over the country in 1950 and destroyed most of its religion and culture following the flight of the Dalai Lama to India in 1959. The book is especially valuable as the record of a journey to Tibet in 1948 by one of the foremost Western scholars of Tibetan religion and civilization. In addition to his profound knowledge of Tibetan history and culture, Tucci brings to bear on his subject a deep personal interest and empathy. The reader feels what the art, practices, and beliefs of the Tibetan people meant to Tucci as well as to the Tibetans themselves. Not a dry academic exercise, the book combines in lively fashion vivid travel writing with a solid grounding in rigorous scholarship.

The first part of Tucci's journey took him up from the Indian hill stations of Darjeeling and Kalimpong over the Himalayas of Sikkim through the Nathu la Pass into the Chumbi Valley of Tibet. Tucci describes the vast and desolate stretches of the route continuing to Gyantse, the main trade center on the route to Lhasa, in the following passage, typical of evocative landscape descriptions sprinkled throughout the book:

On the high tableland a person can be seen from a great distance, like a meaningless black dot on the background of barren, lifeless rocks. Huge, overbearing cliffs crowd the landscape in the boundless waste, with the crushing majesty of nature. Man does not count; he is a tiny being moving along and disappearing without trace, even as the Chinese painters saw him in their metaphysic pictures where the mountain, the clouds and the water spread all over the canvas, and man seems to appear only to give the measure of his nothingness. [p. 48]

From Gyantse, Tucci went over the Karola and Kampa la passes to skirt the fjord-like arms of Yamdrog Lake and cross the Tsangpo River on the standard route to Lhasa. He describes in some detail important monasteries and temples along the way, such as Ralung and Netang—the latter sacred to Atiśa, the great Indian teacher who played a major role in re-introducing Buddhism into Tibet in the eleventh century.

The central chapters of the book are taken up with descriptions of Lhasa, Tucci's meeting with the Dalai Lama, social life in the city, and the huge monastic complexes of Drepung, Sera, and Ganden. This is followed by an unusual account of a 120 mile trip by yak skin boats down the Kyichu and Tsangpo rivers to Samye, the first monastery built in Tibet, and Tsetang, the place where according to Tibetan myth Avalokiteśvara, the bodhisattva of compassion and patron deity of Tibet, took the form of a monkey and mated with a rock ogress to create the primordial ancestors of the Tibetan people. After visiting nearby hermitages and monasteries and engaging in enlightening conversations with monks and hermits, Tucci proceeded...
to the Yarlung Valley with the tombs of the ancient Kings of Tibet. The final chapters describe his return trip to India via Gyantse and Shigatse—the latter the seat of the Panchen Lama and site of the great monastery of Tashilhumpo. The book includes an insert of plates showing rare photographs of monasteries and temples and a way of life lost since destroyed by the Chinese.

Tucci uses the account of his journey as a framework on which to hang discussions of a wide variety of topics, ranging from the role of art in Tibetan meditation to the contemporary follies of European politics. The historical palaces, forts, temples, and monasteries through which he passes afford him the building materials out of which to construct a running narrative of the principal events of Tibetan history, both secular and sacred. He visits, for example, the important pilgrimage place of Samye, the first Buddhist monastery built in Tibet, and tells the story of its founding in the eighth century A.D. Descriptions of paintings and sculpture in various monasteries and temples allow him to launch into extended discussions of styles of art and the role of images in the visualizations of Buddhist yoga. Conversations with lamas, hermits, mediums, and exorcists become opportunities to provide insightful glimpses into the esoteric practices of Tibetan Buddhism and their relation to Western philosophy and psychology. A visit to a lonely spot where corpses are exposed to birds in the Tibetan practice of sky burial prompts a long discourse on the visionary experiences of the bardo—the intermediate state between death and rebirth (or the higher goal of enlightenment) described in the so-called Tibetan Book of the Dead. In the course of these digressions Tucci presents marvelous descriptions of the spiritual forces depicted in art and evoked in ritual:

The images, now peaceful, now terrific, seem to jump up alive before your eyes, to crowd on you like ghosts and to engrave themselves mercilessly into the bottom of your subconscious so as to haunt your dreams as well. You would think that the painters have by some wizardry conjured up living forces and driven them into their work, and that these could float out of the walls, force their way into your soul and take possession of it by a magic spell. [p. 57]

To Lhasa and Beyond provides in an accessible and entertaining form enlightening glimpses of ideas and material presented in a less readable and more systematic fashion in Tucci’s scholarly works such as Tibetan Painted Scrolls, The Theory and Practice of the Mandala, and The Religions of Tibet. Its vivid descriptions and lucid explanations make esoteric points of Tibetan religion and philosophy understandable to laymen as well as scholars. Amid the profusion of books that have now appeared on Tibet, To Lhasa and Beyond stands out as one of the few first-hand accounts of what Tibetan culture and religion were like when they were still intact in their homeland. And among those few works, it holds a singular place as the personal travel account of a master scholar of Tibetan civilization.

Occasionally, in his efforts to universalize his subject and relate it to Western ideas and concerns, Tucci goes a little too far, as in a few passages where he refers to “God” in explaining Tibetan practices—an approach alien to the Buddhist tradition, based as it is on the ultimate realization of emptiness. In an unfortunate omission the publishers of the reprint have dropped the index from the original English translation, making it more difficult to find and keep track of unfamiliar terms and place names. They have also reduced the external dimensions of the book, eliminating the beautiful Tibetan painting that graced its cover. But these are extremely minor points that do not detract from the overall value of the book.

To Lhasa and Beyond provides excellent background reading for anyone contemplating a visit to Central Tibet. It helps travelers to put what
they see in a historical and cultural context so that they can understand it better and appreciate how much of profound value has been lost in Tibet. Anthropologists, historians, and students of Tibetan civilization will find many interesting tidbits of information scattered through the text. The book will also be of use to scholars of Tibetan language and religion, grounding their studies of textual material in the lives and physical settings of the people who created those texts and lived by their teachings.

Edwin Bernbaum
University of California,
Berkeley
The Inner Teachings of Taoism

When examining the three major religious traditions of China (Taoism, Confucianism and Buddhism), one quickly notices that there is a great deal of cross-traditional exchange taking place. One of the more interesting is the exchange that took place between Buddhism and Taoist wai-tan (outer alchemy) when Buddhism entered China around the second century. The inter-play between these two traditions lead to what Isabelle Robinet refers to as "completely Chinese and Taoist reaction to Buddhism:" nei-tan (inner or spiritual alchemy). The tradition of inner alchemy, which uses the alchemical methods and theories to internally perfect the inner self, is the topic of Thomas Cleary's translation of The Inner Teachings of Taoism.

The Inner Teachings of Taoism is divided into four sections: 1) a general introduction; 2) the Inner Teachings; 3) a text of Liu I-ming's entitled "On Solving Symbolic Language"; and 4) three other texts of Liu's which related to the topic of spiritual alchemy. The text to which Cleary refers in the title of the work makes up an extremely small portion of this book. The Inner Teachings is a "simplified" and "condensed version" of another of Chang's works (also translated by Cleary) entitled Understanding Reality (p. xv). The text itself is made up of twenty rather cryptic four line verses which are in turn divided into two sections: the first three verses present a general summary of the overall process of spiritual alchemy while the remaining sixteen verses follow with a more in-depth examination of the entire process.

For his part, Liu I-ming follows each of the four line verses of The Inner Teachings with a useful, although still somewhat cryptic, explanatory commentary in which he begins to explain the many metaphors of Chang. In an effort to "let students understand at a glance and be further able to comprehend the true interpretation without getting involved in speculation," (p. 32) Liu adds...
twenty short "Explanatory Verses," twenty-four "Essentials for Students" and twenty-four "Secrets of Alchemy" to the end of The Inner Teachings. Throughout these three additional commentaries Liu belabors his point that all alchemical language is meant as metaphor for inner/spiritual techniques.

The next major portion of The Inner Teachings is a work written by Liu I-ming entitled On Solving Symbolic Language. In this section Liu continues hammering home his point about the metaphorical nature of alchemical language. He writes:

The alchemical classics all use metaphors to illustrate principles; they are telling people to discern from the image the principle and act on the image. It is a pity that people do not investigate the principles, only recognizing the images. There are very many symbolic expressions used in alchemical classics; students should proceed from the symbol to discover the principle (p. 53-54).

In addition to his comments on symbolic language, Liu includes an interesting presentation on the alchemical firing process which is a text based on seven diagrams representing the process of producing humans by following natural processes, seven diagrams representing the process of creating immortals by reversing the natural processes and fourteen diagrams which are meant to provide an idea of how to go along with the creation and reversal of creation. In this presentation Liu also emphasizes the need to conduct the practice of alchemy in the proper manner with a proper teacher. This can be better understood by noting that Liu, like Chang, was extremely familiar with Confucian teachings, and it is not difficult to imagine that this familiarity probably influenced his understanding of Taoist alchemy.

The last section of this work is dedicated to three other writings by Liu that relate to the notion of spiritual alchemy. The first, Fifty Verses of Resolve Doubts, is a collection of short passages which are designed to convey Liu's understanding of Taoist alchemy (emphasis on the symbolic nature of alchemical language) to students of alchemy. The Fifty Verses covers topics such as the cinnabar crucible, self-refinement, and the spiritual embryo. The second part, On the True Opening of the Mysterious Female, provides a colorful description of The True Opening and follows with another commentary on the misuse of metaphorical language. The third part of this section, Essential Teachings for Cultivating Reality, presents us with Liu's brief summary of the process of becoming "enlightened."

Although the need for translations of Taoist works is great, that need is not helped by Thomas Cleary. He presents the bulk of this book without an ounce of desperately needed context (his introduction is far from adequate). He seems to operate under the assumption that there is no need to share with his readers even a glimpse of original Chinese texts. The fact that this work is completely devoid of documentation or bibliographic data of any form detracts from this work. In short, Thomas Cleary's translation, The Inner Teachings of Taoism, falls far short of being anything more than an interesting addition to the growing library of "pop" theology.

Louis Aaron Collonge
San Jose State University
San Jose, CA
The Korean Neo-Confucianism of Yi Yulgok

Those interested in the impact of Buddhism on East Asia have long paid attention to work on Neo-Confucianism. Most of this work has been concerned with the Neo-Confucian tradition in China, some with the tradition in Japan, much less with the tradition in Korea, and virtually none with its development in Vietnam. With regard to Korea, it has only been in recent years that the territory has been charted and the contributions of key figures presented in book length works in English. The publication in 1985 of The Rise of Neo-Confucianism in Korea, edited by Wm. Theodore deBary and JaHyun Kim Haboush (New York: Columbia University Press), marked a turning point by giving the English speaking world a general, if selective, overview. Since that time a book dedicated to each of the two best known figures in Korean Neo-Confucianism has appeared. Yi Yulgok (1536-84) is treated in the book under review here; and Yi T’oege (1501-70) is treated in Michael C. Kalton, To Become a Sage: The Ten Diagrams on Sage Learning by Yi T’oege (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988).

Ro’s book grew, in part, out of his Ph.D. dissertation: “The Search for a Dialogue between the Confucian ‘Sincerity’ and the Christian Reality: The Neo-Confucian Thought of Yi Yulgok and the Theology of Heinrich Ott” (University of California, Santa Barbara, 1982). The present work devotes little space to the dissertation topic (pp. 94-95). It is a detailed examination of Yi Yulgok’s thought, although it provides thorough background information regarding each aspect of Chinese Neo-Confucian thought which Yulgok treated. Its aim is not to discuss Confucianism and Christianity. Furthermore, it has little explicit coverage of Buddhist influence on Neo-Confucian thought in China or Korea, yet one can learn much on this by reading between the lines.

Ro’s book is organized in three chapters, preceded by an introduction and followed by a conclusion. The Introduction treats Yi Yulgok’s life and his place within Korean Neo-Confucianism and, also, presents the scope and approach of the book as a whole. The three chapters cover, respectively, Yulgok’s cosmology and ontology, his anthropology, and the concept ch’eng (sincerity; Korean, song) as the key element in his thought, unifying cosmology, ontology, and anthropology. The Conclusion summarizes the accomplishments of the three chapters and considers Yulgok’s contribution to contemporary philosophy.

Among the basic facts of Yi Yulgok’s life, a few are important for our purposes. Although junior to Yi T’oege, and not blessed with as long a life span, Yi Yulgok was a more original thinker. Like T’oege, he lived more than a century after the period early in the Yi Dynasty (1392-1910) when Buddhism was first suppressed by the Korean state in favor of Confucianism. Thus, his generation of Neo-Confucian thinkers was not so much interested in establishing the superiority of Confucianism over Buddhism as it was interested in defining the nature of Confucian orthodoxy. This is one reason why Ro’s book has so little to say on the Buddhist-Confucian issue. Moreover,
according to Ro, Yulgok is an especially good example of a thinker who puts the stamp of "Korea" on the Confucian tradition. The consistently non-dualistic stance of Yulgok, we are told, corresponds with non-dualism as a way of thinking found throughout the "Korean spiritual tradition" (p. xiii).

Indeed, the two themes in Yulgok's understanding of Neo-Confucianism that the book features are his "non-dualistic vision" and "anthropocosmic awareness" (p. 2). "Non-dualism" actually refers to a position that is neither dualistic nor monistic. And what Ro terms "anthropocosmic awareness" is itself characterized, above all, by its being a non-dualistic view: "his [Yulgok's] view of the fundamental unity between man's cultivation and the cosmic force of destiny" (p. 2). Yulgok's main contribution was, thus, to overcome a dualistic tendency in the Neo-Confucian thought of his time. As the Introduction asserts, and the rest of the book demonstrates, Yulgok's effort to establish a non-dualistic view permeates every area of his thought: cosmological, ontological, anthropological.

In his comments on the "scope and approach" of his book (pp. 10-14), Ro himself issues a caution about the use of a Western framework, including the use of such terms as cosmological, ontological, etc., to try to understand a Korean thinker. He wants to avoid the "reductionism" inherent in such an approach. Ro says that his own approach will be a hermeneutical one, following Heidegger and Gadamer, with the intention of grasping the underlying hermeneutical motive which penetrates Yulgok's thought, which is a non-dualistic way of thinking.

Ro's success in escaping a Western reduction of Yulgok's work will be evaluated later in this review. But one thing is certain, he must be appreciated for his awareness of relevant hermeneutical principles, such as "interpretation is a struggle with text" (p. 12), in his efforts. It is clear throughout the book that Ro is self-consciously struggling, as he says, "to allow Yulgok to appear and speak (in the Heideggerian sense of the word)" (p. 11).

In Chapter One, when Ro formally introduces the three areas of Neo-Confucian thought he will cover—cosmology, ontology, and anthropology—he provides a disclaimer. Neo-Confucians never actually used these categories to expound their arguments; they are useful only as hermeneutical "tools" (p. 16). The cosmological and ontological dimensions of Neo-Confucian thought, among Yulgok and his Chinese predecessors, are the topic of Chapter One. Therein Ro specifies how certain thinkers were relatively more interested in the cosmological side of key concepts, such as t'ai-chi ("the Great Ultimate"), while others were interested in their ontological side. Yulgok, developing the views of Chu Hsi (1130-1200), whose school of Neo-Confucian thought dominated in Korea, produced a non-dualistic, "cosmo-ontological" view of t'ai-chi. In accord with Chu Hsi's insistence on the interdependence of li (principle) and ch'i (material force), Yulgok did not let t'ai-chi reign as a purely ontological entity apart from the world.

Yulgok's relatively more thoroughgoing insistence on the interdependence of li and ch'i shows itself with greater strength and significance in Chapter Two's discussion of Yulgok's "anthropology." As Ro states: "This non-dualistic characterization of li and ch'i is defined more clearly in Yulgok's anthropology, particularly in his understanding of the mind, that [sic] it is in his cosmology and ontology" (p. 39). Most specifically, Yulgok's role in the so-called "four-seven" debate shows him to be intent on expunging any dualism of li and the explanation of the functioning of "mind" (hsin). Because of its importance, let us digress on this at some length as our primary example of Yulgok's creative thought.

Korean Neo-Confucians showed great interest in the mind-body problem as addressed in the discussion of the "four beginnings" (commisera-
tion, shame and dislike, respect and reverence, and right and wrong) and the “seven feelings” (pleasure, anger, sorrow, fear, love, hate, and desire). Yi T’oegye had related the mind’s issuance of the “four beginnings” to li, and the issuance of the “seven feelings” to ch’i. Although he seemed to think he was explicating Chu Hsi’s position in a noncontroversial manner, a debate ensued. Yulgok’s contribution is found in his correspondence with Song Hon (1535-98), a supporter of T’oegye’s position. For Yulgok, a division of mental issu­ances (i.e., activities of the mind aroused by contact with the world) into discrete categories was supported neither by experience nor by standard Neo-Confucian views on li and ch’i (which for him as for T’oegye came from Chu Hsi). He refused to accept any position that would make it appear that li could issue forth and function independently of ch’i or vice versa. To avoid dualism, he explained the seven feelings as being inclusive of the four beginnings. According to Yulgok: “The ‘seven feelings’ refer to the totality of the human mind when it has been aroused by the external world. The ‘four beginnings’ refer to the good side of the ‘seven feelings’” (Ro’s translation, p. 68).

This solution also prevented the misinterpretation that “evil” was somehow ontologically grounded in any category of ch’i-related (physical) mental issu­ances. Since the “seven feelings” are taken to represent the totality of the mind aroused by contact with the world, any feeling not directed correctly may become “evil.” As a result, Ro explains: “The problem of evil is thus not an ontological one but a volitional one” (p. 68). To the extent that early Neo-Confucians (including, if not especially, Chu Hsi) had tended toward a dualism of sensual and spiritual in trying to explain the roots of “evil” behavior, Yulgok sought to save the tradition from this tendency toward dualism as well as from simplistically placing the blame on discretely sensual aspects of humans.

Turning to Chapter Three, we find our final example of Yulgok’s non-dualistic approach: his explanation of ch’eng (sincerity) as the essence of an “anthropocosmic awareness” whereby the sage transforms the world as well as himself. Yulgok is not unique in considering ch’eng, as a quality of the sage, to have cosmic as well as moral force. The seeds of this view existed in classical Confucianism, and its explication was important to earlier generations of Neo-Confucians. Yet one becomes convinced, as Ro provides example after example, that Yulgok developed it with his characteristically self-conscious­ly non-dualistic approach. Giving only his final yet perhaps most important example, ch’eng was the basis for the unity of thought and action in Yulgok’s own life as a “theoretician and pragmatist” deeply involved in political affairs (pp. 107-110). To a greater extent than most other Korean Neo-Confucian thinkers, including T’oegye, Yulgok was an active states­men, holding a variety of high positions during his life (provincial Governor, Minister of Personnel, Minister of Justice, Minister of Defense, etc.).

Ro’s Conclusion, in addition to summarizing, presents some comments about what Yulgok’s thought has to offer us today. His comments cover two key aspects of moral and spiritual thought. First, thinking today is too often characterized by a division of anthropology and cosmology; or, put another way, theology has become anthropology. As Western religious thinkers have abandoned efforts to salvage their outmoded (i.e., Christian) cosmologies. As to Yulgok’s “anthropocosmic” view, Ro writes: “This view of a continuity between the social and the natural worlds, of Man fully integrated into the natural order, implies a disturbing critique of the modern Western view of an indifferent nature and alienated humanity” (p. 113). Second, Ro also sees us challenged by the way that, “in Yulgok’s non-dualistic approach, paradigmatic Western categories—body and mind, spirit and matter, thought and feeling—are by­passed in favor of a cohesive, holistic understand­ing” (p. 114). We are challenged because, although Yulgok’s view is non-theistic and non-dualistic, it is still “essentially religious” (p. 115).
How do we evaluate Ro's work? On the one hand, it claims to present us with a thinker who has great relevance for Western thinkers today. On the other hand, it claims that this thinker cannot be understood by any Western "reduction" and, therefore, must be allowed to speak to us in his own voice. Obviously, then, an evaluation of Ro's work must focus, above all, on its success in completing the daunting task of intercultural interpretation.

First of all, Ro should be congratulated for being aware of the difficulties in the task facing him. Not only at the beginning, when such issues are usually addressed in works of this type, but throughout the book, one has the feeling that Ro is doing his best to let Yulgok's own voice reach us. He carefully chooses between available translations of technical terms, between English translations and Romanizations of terms, between using and avoiding established Western categories. Thus, Ro's work is a model of the process one should go through in trying to allow material from another culture reach a new audience. One unfortunate exception to this is the large number of errors in the Romanization of Chinese. The glossary alone has about fifteen, including placing all "p" entries out of alphabetical order, after those under "f."

Secondly, as to the result of this process, Ro's works has strengths as well as weaknesses. As one might expect, continual use of Western philosophical terms, despite the disclaimer that the terms are only hermeneutical tools, can disguise as well as amplify a Korean thinker's voice. The key issue is not whether to use such terms at all; their careful use is a key to success. The issue is whether or not one chooses the most appropriate terms. For example, there are good reasons to employ a term like "anthropocosmic," already used to good effect by others discussing the Neo-Confucian tradition, such as Tu Wei-ming. This term communicates the unity of human and natural, social and cosmic, for a tradition that has consistently insisted on their fundamental oneness. More questionable is the use of "ontological," as opposed to "cosmological," especially when one concedes that it is not a native distinction for either Chinese or Koreans. Is there anything in the Neo-Confucian world view that indicates that it has an "ontological" as well as "cosmological" dimension? Probably not. There is certainly nothing beyond the cosmos, in Neo-Confucian's eyes, for they have a thoroughly immanental view of ultimate reality. Moreover, there is little indication that, for them, there are ontologically different substances within the cosmos. What seems important to Neo-Confucians, including Yulgok (see p. 31), is the distinction between what is subtle or "concealed" (we) and what is gross or "manifested" (hsien). The "Ultimate" is not beyond nature, or different from the rest of nature, it is just ultimately more subtle. This kind of distinction is better covered within "cosmology" than by introducing a cosmology-ontology division.

We must also address the most important interpretive term that Ro uses: "non-dualism." Despite Ro's frequent reminders that "non-dualism" does not mean "monism," one wonders why he put himself in the position of having continually to remind us that his key term does not mean what we are likely to think it does. One drawback to his choice is that it continually draws our attention to the "problem" of dualism and monism, which has been a problem in the West, and perhaps in India, but not in East Asia. A related drawback is that it does not draw sufficient attention to what is a key problem in East Asian thought: balance of opposites. One might interpret Yulgok's "hermeneutical motive" as being against imbalance, against leaning to one side, rather than against "monism" and/or "dualism." This would be in line with our understanding, for example, of Korean Neo-Confucian criticisms of Buddhism and the Wang Yang-ming style of Neo-Confucianism. While it is questionable that Neo-Confucians thought in terms of "monism" and "dualism," it is clear that they thought about balance of opposites: li and ch'i, yin and yang, contemplation and action, natural and human, and so forth.
Is there a term that captures the key problematik of Yulgok’s thought yet escapes the drawbacks of “non-dualism”? One is suggested in Julia Ching’s article on Yulgok’s contribution to the “Four-Seven Debate” in The Rise of Neo-Confucianism in Korea (op. cit., pp. 303-322, esp. p. 313), where she speaks of “dialectical unity” to characterize his approach to pairs of opposites, such as li and ch’i. This is one example of a term that, in our view, is superior to “non-dualism.”

It may seem unreasonable that our major criticism is a terminological one. However, it is one connected with Ro’s main purpose: presenting the thought of a leading Korean Neo-Confucian in a way that avoids the danger of its reduction to Western categories. If the terminological problem stands out, it is only because Ro’s book is otherwise so successful in achieving its purpose. That is to say, it is successful precisely in providing a model for how to interpret a thinker from a culture markedly different from our own.

Christian Jochim
San Jose State University,
San Jose, CA
IN MEMORIAM:
Minor Lee Rogers (1930 - 1991)

We are very sorry to report the passing of Dr. Minor Rogers on August 25, 1991. He received his Ph. D. at Harvard University in the field of comparative religion in 1972. From that time to the present he taught in the Department of Religion at Washington and Lee University, Lexington, Virginia.

Dr. Rogers is held in high repute for his rigorous and meticulous scholarship and his deep personal involvement with Shin Buddhism. His gracious warmth and encouragement has inspired us at the Institute. His major work Rennyo: The Second Founder of Shin Buddhism, which he wrote together with his wife Ann, had just been sent to the publisher prior to his untimely passing. The following bibliography of his various publications was provided by Ann T. Rogers.

PUBLICATIONS

Book:


Articles:


“A View of Rennyo’s Early and Middle Years,” in Jōdokyō no kenkyū: Ishida Mitsuyuki hakase koki kinen ronbun (Essays on the Pure Land Buddhist Thought: In Honor of Dr. Mitsuyuki Ishida on the Occasion of his Seventieth Birthday), (Kyoto: Nagata Bunshódō, 1982), 101-124.


Translational

Translation into English  [with Ann T. Rogers]: “Introduction” to Asaeda Zenshō, *Heian shōki bukkōshi kenkyū* (A Study in Early Heian Buddhist History), (Kyoto: Nagata Bunshōdō, 1980), 1-10

Translation committee: *Shōzōmatsu Wasan: Shinran’s Hymns on the Last Age*, (Kyoto: Ryūkoku University Press, 1980).


Translation into English [with Ann T. Rogers]: Rennyo Shōnin Ofumi, Bukkyō Dendo Kyōkai project to translate the Chinese Buddhist Canon (forthcoming).

Reviews:


Masao Abe, Zen and Western Thought, in Chanoyu Quarterly, 51 (1987), 64-66.


Perhaps the greatest patron of Buddhism in modern times is The Reverend Dr. Yehan Numata, a 95-year old industrialist turned philanthropist, who received an Honorary Doctor of Humanities degree from the University of Hawaii in December 1988. Yehan Numata though born into a temple family, became a businessman solely to obtain profits which could be diverted to the propagation of Buddhism. His belief was that the Buddha’s teachings, which are based on the spirit of wisdom and compassion, would assist in bringing about lasting peace and happiness for all humanity. Embarking on his quest, he established a precision measuring instruments manufacturing company called Mitutoyo Corporation in 1934. Profits from the enterprise enabled him to found the Bukkyo Dendo Kyokai (Buddhist Promoting Foundation) (acronym BDK) in 1965. Under his guidance, this organization began to sponsor various activities to share the teachings of the Buddha with as many people as possible. Late in life, Yehan Numata became a Buddhist priest.

The Teaching of Buddha. The first and most significant project undertaken thus far has been the re-editing, re-publishing and dissemination of The Teaching of Buddha, a small book containing the essence of Buddha Dharma. The book was an abridged translation of the Japanese work, Shinyaku Bukkyo Seiten (The New Translation of the Buddhist Scriptures) compiled and published by the Bukkyo Kyokai (The Buddhist Society) under the supervision of The Reverend Muan Kizu in 1925. It was believed that not only would The Teaching of Buddha be an authoritative introduction to Buddhism, but it could also become a daily source of inspiration and a guide for daily living. In order to make it understandable and available to the peoples of the world, the book has been translated into 35 different languages, printed, and nearly four million copies distributed free of charge in 47 countries.

Tripitaka Translation Project. Another major undertaking was the translation and publication of the voluminous Taisho Chinese Tripitaka in English, first initiated in 1982 in Tokyo. It was the desire of Yehan Numata to introduce the still largely unexplored Chinese Mahayana Tripitaka throughout the English-speaking world. A 13-member group of leading Japanese Buddhist scholars, headed by Professor Shoyu Hanayama of the Musashino Women’s College, was formed as the Tripitaka Editorial Committee, along with the Tripitaka Publications Committee chaired by Professor Shojun Bando of the Otani University. These two committees are responsible for administering the overall project of the translation and publication of approximately 10% of the Chinese Tripitaka by the year 2000 A.D. Dr. Gadjin Nagao, Professor Emeritus of Kyoto University, is currently the overall advisor of the entire project.

Buddhist Studies Chairs. The third major project was the endowment of Buddhist Chairs at leading universities of the world. It was Yehan Numata’s objective to make the teachings of Mahayana Buddhism available to the academic world on a day-to-day basis. Begun in 1984, the Numata Chairs in Buddhist Studies have been established at six institutions in the U.S., the University of California at Berkeley, Harvard University, University of Chicago, University of Hawaii, Smith College and the Institute of Buddhist Studies in Berkeley, and one in Canada, the University of Calgary. Negotiations
are currently underway with some universities in Europe for similar chairs. Sufficient contributions to the endowed chairs are made annually for up to twenty years, by which time each chair is expected to have become self-perpetuating from the cumulative funds.

**Administrative Control.** In order to supervise the activities to promote Buddhism in overseas areas, Yehan Numata insisted that in each country concerned, a local organization should be formed to be financially and operationally responsible for all propagational activities undertaken. Toward this end, a number of affiliates of BDK Japan were organized in countries where branches of the Mitutoyo Corporation were located, such as in the United States, Brazil, Mexico, Canada, Taiwan, Singapore, West Germany and England. In the United States, the first such organization, called the Buddhist Educational Studies, Inc., was formed in 1982 in Springfield, Virginia, to publish Buddhist materials and conduct educational activities. In 1986, it was superseded by the Buddha Dharma Kyōkai (Society), Inc. (acronym BDK USA) in Emerson, New Jersey. Its first President is The Reverend Kenryii Tsuji, Minister, Ekōji Temple, Springfield, VA, and the former Bishop of the Buddhist Churches of America, and as Trustees, Shigeru Yamamoto, former Chairman of the Board, MI Corporation, MITUTOYO U.S. & Canada Operations, Bishop Seigen Yamashita, the current Head of the Buddhist Churches of America, and The Reverend Seishin Yamashita, Director of the Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research. This organization serves as the headquarters and the umbrella for all of the propagational activities in the U.S. It retains control over the U.S. responsibilities for the Tripitaka Translation Project, the distribution of *The Teaching of Buddha*, and the administering of the Numata Chairs in Buddhist Studies, as well as miscellaneous projects, including publications.

**Numata Center.** The Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research was established in November 1984 in Berkeley, CA. Its dedication and opening ceremonies were attended by the leaders of BDK Japan and by Dr. George Rupp, then Dean of the Divinity School at Harvard and Provost Leonard Kuhi of the University of California at Berkeley, along with many distinguished Buddhist scholars and guests. The principal role played by the Numata Center is to act as the agent of BDK Japan in the Tripitaka Translation and Publication Project and assist in the finalization of the translation manuscripts. It also assists the BDK USA and BDK Japan in the accomplishment of their respective missions. Key staff members include Dr. Nobuo Haneda and the Reverends Shojo Oi and Seishin Yamashita.

**Distribution of The Teaching of Buddha.** For this function, two organizations were formed. The Sudatta Society was established in Hawaii in 1978. Its leadership has been in the hands of Mr. Ralph Honda, a prominent Honolulu businessman, from the very beginning. Through his diligent efforts, 190,000 copies of *The Teaching of Buddha* have been distributed to hotels, hospitals, prisons, and military units in the Hawaiian Islands. The other organization is the Society for Buddhist Understanding established in 1978 in the City of Industry, California. The head of this group is Mr. Tomohito Katsunuma. Thus far, Mr. Katsunuma has succeeded in the distribution and placement of 325,000 copies of *The Teaching of Buddha* in hotels, libraries, temples, and the military forces on the U.S. mainland.
**Tripiṭaka Translation and Publication.** The Tripiṭaka Editorial Committee in Japan selected 80 prominent Buddhist scholars, who were able to translate the Buddhist Scriptures from classical Chinese into English. These academicians were selected from ten different countries, with the U.S. and Japan having 40% and 45% of the translators respectively. Among the American scholars chosen are Professors Stanley Weinstein of Yale University, Lewis Lancaster of University of California at Berkeley, David Chappell of University of Hawaii, Richard Gard of Institute for Advanced Studies of World Religions, Taitetsu Unno of Smith College, Minoru Kiyota of University of Wisconsin, Robert Gimello of University of Arizona, Francis Cook of University of California at Riverside, John Keenan of Middlebury College, Minor Rogers of Washington and Lee University, Leo Pruden of University of Oriental Studies, Paul Groner of University of Virginia, Allen Andrews of University of Vermont, Kenneth Tanaka of Institute of Buddhist Studies in Berkeley, and Drs. Diana Paul, J. C. and Thomas Cleary. Some of the Tripiṭaka texts being translated by these scholars are the *Diamond Sutra* (T-235), *Śrīmālā Sūtra* (T-353), *Avatāṃsaka Sūtra* (T-278), *Commentary on the Lotus Sutra* (T-1519), *Śūrabhāgavatī Sūtra* (T-642), *Commentary on Vasubandhu’s Triṣūkātika* (T-1585), *Profound Meaning of the “Three Treatises”* (T-1852), *Commentary on the Buddhaśūmi Sūtra* (T-1530), *Compendium of the Mahayana* (T-1593), *Blue Cliff Record* (T-2003), *Gateless Barrier* (T-2005), *Bodaishinron* (T-1665), and *Rokusodōnyō* (T-2008). For these and all other translations, the BDK USA makes payments worldwide through the Numata Translation Center in Berkeley, CA. The translation project is progressing smoothly with the first volume expected to appear in 1991. Among the first texts to be published are the *Śrīmālā Sūtra*, *The Golden Light Sutra*, *The Lotus Sutra*, *The Four-Part Vinaya*, and the *Commentary on the Lotus Sutra*.

**Visiting Professorships in Buddhism in USA.** During 1984, two Numata Chairs in Buddhist Studies were established, at the University of California, Berkeley, and at Harvard. Since its inception at the University of California, five Japanese professors have filled the chair: Professors Hisao Inagaki of Ryukoku University, Shōryū Katsura of Hiroshima University, Musashi Tachikawa of Nagoya University, and Professors Emeritus Akira Fujieda of Kyoto University, and Jikido Takasaki of Tokyo University. At Harvard, three professors have completed their assignments, Professor Yuichi Kajiyma of Kyoto University, Professor Michio Tokunaga of Kyoto Women’s College, and Professor Jikido Takasaki, . The University of Chicago was endowed with a chair in 1985. Three professors, Dr. Yoshiro Tamura of Rissho University, Dr. Masao Abe, Professor Emeritus of Nara University of Education, and Professor Thomas Kasulis of Northland College have taught in the program. The University of Hawaii received its chair in 1988, with the first Visiting Professor being Dr. Hisao Inagaki followed by Professor Shudo Ishii of Komazawa University. In 1986, a Numata Chair was established at the Institute of Buddhist Studies in Berkeley, CA. Under a special teaching arrangement, the following professors have lectured at the Institute: Dr. Roger Corless of Duke University, Dr. Allan Andrews of University of Vermont, Dr. Whalen Lai of University of California at Davis, and Dr. John Carman of Harvard.

**Publication of Buddha Dharma.** Since the popular The Teaching of Buddha was a condensed version of a much longer text, the decision was made in 1982 to make available to the English reading public an unabridged edition of Muan Kizu’s *The New Translation of Buddhist Scriptures*. This
would provide the essence of Buddhist doctrines in considerable detail. The first edition of the complete translation, called *Buddha Dharma*, was translated by Buddhist scholars in America and published in 1984. The revised second edition, complete with a section on Scriptural Sources, a glossary, and index is due to be published in early 1991, again by the BDK USA. For both editions, Buddhist Churches of America Minister Emeritus Kyoshiro Tokunaga, as the editor-in-chief, devoted countless hours in bringing the project to fruition.

*Pacific World.* The first issue of the *Pacific World* was published in June 1925 by Yehan Numata when he was still an undergraduate at the University of California, Berkeley. As the editor-in-chief, he published it on a bi-monthly basis in 1925 and 1926, and then on a monthly basis in 1927 and 1928. Articles in the early issues concerned not only Buddhism, but also other cultural subjects such as art, poetry, and education, and then by 1928, the articles became predominantly Buddhistic. Included in the mailing list for the early issues were such addressees as the Cabinet members of the U.S. Government, Chambers of Commerce, political leaders, libraries, publishing houses, labor unions and foreign institutions. The publication of the *Pacific World* ceased after Yehan Numata returned to Japan following completion of his studies in 1928 and the receipt of a M.A. degree in statistics. The lack of funds also precluded further publication. In 1982, the publication of the *Pacific World* was again resumed, this time on an annual basis by the Institute of Buddhist Studies with funds provided by the foundation, BDK USA. The 1989 autumn issue of the journal was distributed to 6,500 addressees throughout the world. The journal is now devoted to the dissemination of articles on general and Jodo Shinshu Buddhism for both academic and lay readers.

The officers of BDK USA are grateful for the encouragement and support received from the institutions with endowed chairs, the Buddhist clergy, and lay people in BDK USA efforts to disseminate the teachings of the Buddha throughout the United States and look forward to their continuing assistance.
A Genealogical Chart of the Original Texts of the English Translation of the Buddhist Cannon

BUDDHA 463-383 BCE
- First Council 383 BCE
  - Dharma
  - Vinaya

  - Sūtra-piṭaka
  - Vinaya-piṭaka

  - Abhidharma-piṭaka
  - Second Council 283 BCE
    - Tri-piṭaka ("Three Baskets")
      - Third Council 183 BCE
        - Śrāvaka-piṭaka
        - Bodhisattva-piṭaka (Mahāyāna Scriptures)
          - Fourth Council 25 BCE
            - Chinese Translation
              - 406-1004 Tun-huang Manuscripts
                - Esoteric Scriptures
                  - Sung Edition 972-983
                    - Khitan Edition 990-1010
                      - Koryo Edition (First Edition) 1010-1031
                        - Koryo Edition (Second Edition) 1236-1251
                          - Yuan Edition 1277-1290
                            - Ming Edition 1403-1424
                              - Taishō Edition 1924-1932
                                - English Translation